

SUBJECT: RECOMMENDATIONS AND OUTCOMES FROM SELECT

COMMITTEES (Mid-March – September 2016)

MEETING: CABINET

DATE: 7th September 2016 DIVISION/WARDS AFFECTED: All

1. PURPOSE:

1.1 The purpose of the report is to provide the Cabinet with a record of the recommendations and outcomes of the Select Committee meetings during the middle of March to September 2016).

2. **RECOMMENDATIONS**:

- That the Cabinet acknowledge the contribution made by the Council's Select Committees towards policy development and decision-making;
- ii) That Cabinet Members familiarise themselves with the outcomes of the Select Committees to ensure they respond appropriately to recommendations and requests made by the Select Committees, in line with the Council's Scrutiny and Executive Protocol.

3. KEY ISSUES:

- **3.1** Select Committees conduct a variety of important 'critical friend' roles:
 - Reviewing the appropriateness of existing policy and shaping new policy to ensure 'fitness for purpose';
 - ii) Conducting pre-decision scrutiny, by challenging the rationale for proposed decisions with the decision-maker;
 - iii) Holding the Cabinet Members and Officers to account for their performance, including their management of budgets and risks;
 - iv) Engaging with the public to ensure that the Council is delivering effective services which resonate with needs of the public, their communities and local businesses.
- 3.2 The Select Committees add value by driving improvement in service delivery and through offering constructive challenge to decision makers to ensure decisions are robust. Each Select Committee agrees its forward work programme and undertakes its workload in a flexible manner to ensure diligent scrutiny of key emerging programmes, projects and initiatives. This has led to an increased number of additional Select Committees being called to scrutinise single subjects, sometimes on a recurring basis. The calling of additional meetings is an approach that is favoured over the establishment of numerous task and finish groups, given the ability for

Scrutiny Members to produce quicker outcomes in addition to enabling wider elected Member and public involvement in its meetings.

- 3.3 In line with the Council's Scrutiny and Executive Protocol, Cabinet Members are invited to Select Committees to be challenged upon their performance and also their rationale for decisions they may make. Outcomes of Select Committees are formally recorded in the minutes of Select Committees following 'summing up' by the Select Committee Chair, who will (if appropriate) write to the relevant Cabinet Member or Chief Officer to advise the Committee's stance on an issue together with any recommendation the Select Committee wishes to make. Discussions are frequently held between the Select Committee Chairs and the relevant Cabinet Member following the meeting, with further scrutiny and requests for information identified.
- 3.3 Following a self-evaluation of the scrutiny function in 2014 and a corporate assessment in 2015, the Scrutiny Chairs agreed a need to formally document outcomes and recommendations made by Select Committees via a regular report to the Council's Cabinet. The purpose of the report is to demonstrate the valuable contribution made by Scrutiny Members and to ensure that Cabinet Members are aware of the outcomes of Select Committees, in order that they may respond appropriately.

4. REASONS:

4.1 To implement effective corporate governance and decision-making, through ensuring clarity of role, purpose and mutual expectations of the Select Committees and the Cabinet.

5. RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS:

None identified.

6. SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND EQUALITY IMPLICATIONS:

None identified.

7. SAFEGUARDING AND CORPORATE PARENTING IMPLICATIONS

None identified.

8. CONSULTEES:

Not required.

9. BACKGROUND PAPERS:

None - Minutes publicly available.

10. AUTHOR:

Hazel Ilett, Scrutiny Manager

11. CONTACT DETAILS:

Tel: 01633 644233 E-mail: Hazelilett@monmouthshire.gov.uk

Record of Recommendations/Outcomes from Select Committees during middle March and September 2016 (18 meetings)

Adults Select Committee – 8 th March 2016	
Supporting People Programme	The Committee agreed to support the direction of travel and the main proposals for service development. The Committee suggested there is a need to move towards a simpler way of representing outcomes and members supported the development of a system to understand the service user's perspective.
Community Coordination pilot	The Adults Select Committee concluded that the report provided a robust and evidenced based evaluation which would usefully inform the development of future services. Members supported the report being tabled to Cabinet with some additions: The Committee would encourage further work on research and evaluation issues, with either external help or through internal arrangements. The Committee would like to encourage the concept to be expanded further, with thought given to the rural dimension. The Committee offered its assistance wherever possible.
	The Committee requested that figures/numbers be included in future reporting and noted that the questionnaire would be part of the Cabinet report, which would be emailed to Members for reference.
Disabled Facilities Grants	The Committee considered the options presented in the report and concluded that there should be an increase in available capital funding. The Committee suggested there may be a benefit in coordinating a meeting of the Adults Select Committee and the Planning Committee to discuss the issue with officers from Planning, Housing and Social Services in order to achieve a more joined up approach to independent living in Monmouthshire. The Committee agreed to support the report's recommendation.
Children and Young People's Se	elect Committee – 17 th March 2016
Play Sufficiency Assessment	The Committee scrutinised the progress on the review and preparation of a new action plan for 16/17 for submission to Welsh Government and concluded that whilst they agreed with the report's recommendations, their suggestion would be to limit the number of objectives and actions to be taken forward.
	The Committee recognised the difficulties that officers have experienced in undertaking the work. The Committee encouraged officers to engage with the youth service and Town and Community Councils to seek contributions and ideas. The Committee encouraged officers to engage with the youth service and Town and Community Councils to seek contributions and ideas.
Flying Start	The Committee requested that a report be tabled in advance at future meetings with annual performance data. The Committee were keen not to lose sight of the work that is being undertaken and requested that Flying Start be reported through the future programmes report.

Acorn project

The Chair reiterated that reports should be presented in advance of the meeting and advised that Members would welcome and annual update on progress and funding. The Committee felt that the importance of the service should be recognised by promoting to full Council.

The Chair agreed to request information from the Cabinet Member regarding proposals for reduced staff and the subsequent impact on the service.

Strong Communities Select Committees – 17th March 2016

People and Organisational Development Strategy

The committee were supportive of the strategy and the actions in place to support staff through, training, development opportunities and HR support and welcomed the cohesive approach to supporting employees. Members raised several concerns in terms of sickness absence and staff morale and the Chair advised that there is a working group currently reviewing sickness absence and that the group has been requested to report their findings to the committee in due course. Members welcomed the activities that have been undertaken, such as holding staff conferences and agreed that holding conferences within each directorate may enable a deeper understanding of issues. Members also felt that surveys would enable staff to provide views in an anonymous format, which may assist in highlighting areas of concern. The Committee agreed that the work should continue, with further progress updates brought as appropriate.

Volunteer Strategy and Toolkit

Members welcomed the strategy and Volunteer Toolkit that has been developed to support volunteers in playing an important role in service delivery in the county. The Committee acknowledged that significant work had been undertaken by the Volunteer Lead to provide a model that has been based on lessons learnt by others and commended the approach that has been adopted. The committee were satisfied that there are appropriate safeguarding measures in place to ensure all volunteers are vetted and were reassured that the volunteer strand of working has been included within the Council's Corporate Safeguarding Group.

Members highlighted the need to measure the 'added value' of volunteering through several different perspectives:

- The monetary value that volunteering offers
- The impact of volunteering in terms of projects that have been furthered by volunteers which may not have happened otherwise
- The emotional/social value for volunteers, for example, the impact that volunteering has had on their health, happiness and well-being

The committee asked that the Volunteering Lead consider how the added value of volunteering could be usefully measured in these different formats. Members requested future updates from the officer as appropriate, acknowledging that the committee will be inviting Gwent Association of Voluntary organisations (GAVO) to a future meeting to discuss partnership working and that volunteering may be discussed as part of that agenda.

Month 9 Budget Monitoring

Members reviewed the financial situation at month 9 for projects and programmes within their remit, expressing concern for the budgetary position for the highways division. The committee expressed concern for the Home to School Transport budget and acknowledged that given that

Strategic Equality Plan and Monitoring Report	the Additional Learning Needs transport savings have proven unachievable, it is unlikely that the service is going to be able operate within its existing budget. Members were concerned that the service has requested further funding via the MTFP in 2016-17 and agreed there is a need to review the Home to School Transport Policy and consider the appropriate funding for this service. Members reviewed the financial situation at month 9 for projects and programmes within their remit, expressing concern for the budgetary position for the highways division. The committee expressed concern for the Home to School Transport budget and acknowledged that given that the Additional Learning Needs transport savings have proven unachievable, it is unlikely that the service is going to be able operate within its existing budget. Members were concerned that the service has requested further funding via the MTFP in 2016-17 and agreed there is a need to review the Home to School Transport Policy and consider the appropriate funding for this service. The Chair thanked the Officer for the comprehensive update and requested regular updates.
Economy and Development Sel	ect Committee – 11 th April 2016
i County Strategy and Business Plan 2016/19	The Committee welcomed the report and the views expressed. Members agreed to receive a further report regarding ways to directly work with schools in respect of computer coding for students, as currently the Directorate is having to work around the curriculum with regard to this matter. Also, it was noted that there was scope for further talks with the Children and Young People Directorate and schools regarding the need to create a closer link with the way Maths, IT, and Engineering are taught. These are currently taught under the subject entitled STEM.
Shared Resource Service (SRS)	The Committee welcomed the report and considered that a watching brief be held via the SRS Public Board Meeting minutes with regard to progress being made in respect of the SRS.
Economy and Development Sel	ect Committee – 14 th April 2016
Broadband and Superfast Business ICT Exploitation Programme Car Parking Charges	The Chair thanked BT colleagues for their attendance and welcomed the opportunity to engage and stated that the key area for focus should be to ensure ongoing communication with residents and businesses. The Chair concluded that the focus had been around the blue badge issue, including the stress of the application process, affordability, enforcement. In terms of the wider impact the Committee would welcome a progress report to ensure Members are updated.
	The Head of Operations agreed to investigate options regarding Station Road, Chepstow to incentivise train users.
Adults Select Committee – 26 th	April 2016
Common Allocation Policy (Housing)	The Chair concluded that Adults Select Committee would endorse the policy, however, they recommend that the Cabinet hold a Member Seminar to disseminate knowledge.
Older Person's Commissioner Guidance on scrutinising changes to community services	The Chair agreed to work with the Scrutiny Manager on a formal response to the Older Person's Commissioner. It was suggested that an invitation be issued to the Commissioner for a future meeting.

	March and the Comment of the Comment
and 'Equalities and Human	Members agreed that officers would be invited to attend a future
Rights Impact Assessments'	meeting to discuss partnership arrangements in adult services.
	The committee discussed how it could embed the principles outlined in
	Each guidance paper into scrutiny practice and agreed that the Scrutiny
	Manager would work with the Equalities Officer to develop lines of
	questioning for future scrutiny activity.
	•
Strong Communities Select Cor	mmittees – 28 th April 2016 -
Sustainable Development	The Committee acknowledged the need for Members to be aware of the
Policy	Council's responsibilities and to understand the process. The Committee
	felt that the policy was user friendly and recommended the officer work
	with the Planning Department to ensure sustainability is built into the Local
	Development Plan. Members recognised that the Future Generations Act
	would require the Council to ensure sustainability is built into all future
	decisions and Members supported the officer in undertaking the work to
	implement the act's requirements.
Partnership Mapping Exercise	The Committee accepted the report's recommendations and thanked the
	officer for providing a clear outline of how the work of partners
	contributes to delivering the Single Integrated Plan. Members
	acknowledged the future role for the new Public Service Board Select
	Committee to scrutinise partnerships at a strategic level by holding the
Improvement Plan for 2016-	Local Service Board to account. The Committee supported the report and requested that the Head of
2017	Operations investigate the following issues raised and report back to Select
2017	committee Members:
	Committee Members.
	- The level of recycling generated through incineration
	- Whether the Authority has a mandate to save £250,000 by removing
	glass from the comingled recyclates
	- The cost effectiveness of incineration rather than recycling.
Adults Select Committee – 17 th	
Carers Strategy	It was agreed that the strategy would be endorsed and commended to
	Cabinet, with the appreciation that the programme was living, fluid and
	constantly evolving. The Committee requested to be updated regularly on
	progress and acknowledged that there were three areas of notable
	concern: Respite, Transport and Primary Care.
	The Committee felt the strategy was an excellent piece of work which had
	engaged with service users throughout to arrive at a well evaluated
	strategy.
	January.
Children and Young People's Select Committee – 19th May 2016	
Children and Young People's So	elect Committee – 19 th May 2016
Children and Young People's So Poverty in Monmouthshire	elect Committee – 19 th May 2016 Members supported the community engagement which would be
	•
	Members supported the community engagement which would be
	Members supported the community engagement which would be undertaken through the autumn as part of the well-being assessment led
	Members supported the community engagement which would be undertaken through the autumn as part of the well-being assessment led by the Public Service Board. The Committee felt that there was a need to
	Members supported the community engagement which would be undertaken through the autumn as part of the well-being assessment led by the Public Service Board. The Committee felt that there was a need to engage with people who were living just above the poverty line and
Poverty in Monmouthshire	Members supported the community engagement which would be undertaken through the autumn as part of the well-being assessment led by the Public Service Board. The Committee felt that there was a need to engage with people who were living just above the poverty line and encouraged officers to obtain information from the school community, as well as obtaining children's views.
	Members supported the community engagement which would be undertaken through the autumn as part of the well-being assessment led by the Public Service Board. The Committee felt that there was a need to engage with people who were living just above the poverty line and encouraged officers to obtain information from the school community, as

	work streams would need to be addressed by both this Committee and the
	Public Service Board Select Committee.
	The Select Committee felt that they could help assist in raising awareness of the programme at ward level and agreed that the Scrutiny Manager could provide the Partnership and Engagement JAFF Coordinator with the email addresses of the Select Committee.
	Members agreed to review progress on the Families First Programme in nine month's time.
Economy and Development Sel	ect Committee – 9 th June 2016
Circuit of Wales	Circuit of Wales: Members suggested that as the deal moves forward, all relevant information would need to fed back to Committee for thorough scrutiny to take place.
Skutrade	Skutrade: The Committee agreed to receive an update in September.
Revenue and Capital Outturn report	The Chair reminded officers that in future, in order to provide the necessary context, there is a need for the Chief Officer as well as the Finance Officer to be present for scrutiny of budget reports.
Monmouthshire Business and Enterprise end of year report Update	The Committee welcomed the regular updates on the schemes and requested that the statistics on the broadband roll out be emailed to the Committee.
Economy and Development Select Committee Business Breakfast Feedback	The Committee agreed the findings of the business breakfast and requested that relevant officers are invited to a future meeting to discuss areas that may benefit from further scrutiny.
Verbal Update - Events Strategy	The Committee requested to scrutinise the formal debrief of the Velethon which should be completed by September and agreed to table this to a future meeting.
Adults Select Committee – 21st	June 2016
Citizens Advice Bureau: 'Better Advice Better Lives' Report	The Chair concluded that the report would be useful to all members and suggested that the service presented to a full council meeting. The need for further collaboration across agencies was seen as paramount to ensure information was not duplicated and that useful information was easier to disseminate. The Chair thanked both guests for the enlightening report and stressed that the Committee would revisit the issues discussed via regular updates and briefings.
Revenue and Capital Outturn report	The Chair thanked the Finance Manager for another pleasing report and stressed that the Committee appreciated the hard work of the staff. It was recognised by the very nature of the portfolio, there were often things that could not be predicted or controlled. The report was recommended to Cabinet and the Chair looked forward to future updates.
Feedback on Member's Seminars by the Chief Officer	The Head of Officer for Social Care discussed recent Member Seminars, giving special praise to the Dementia Training, commenting on the powerful presentation. The Chief Officer thanked Members as she felt their comments gave officers focus for action plans and helped drive issues forward. Members expressed disappointment at the number of members who did not attend, as they felt the seminars were a valuable tool.

Public Service Board Select Committee - 28th June 2016

Governance Report for the Public Service Board (PSB) Select Committee

The Committee agreed that the report outlining governance arrangements for the Select Committee would be accepted, subject to the following amendments:

- (i) The Chair would remain in place until the subsequent Select Committee meeting
- (ii) Co-optees would be considered on an 'as and when necessary' basis.

Members agreed that future PSB Select Committee agendas would provide a link to the minutes and agendas of the PSB during each Select Committee meeting period.

The Committee accepted that the draft terms of reference for the Select Committee would be agreed at the next meeting (to feature on the agenda of each PSB Select Committee meeting).

Public Service Board Working Arrangements and Governance Report for the Public Service Board

The Select Committee agreed that the Chair would write to the Chair of the PSB to:

- (i) reflect the Select Committee's concerns about the capacity of the team to deliver the work on behalf of the PSB;
- (ii) advise that the PSB will not be required to attend all meetings of the PSB Select Committee (invites to be offered as and when required);
- (iii) request that the PSB agrees a brief action list at the close of each of their meetings to assist the Select Committee in monitoring the PSB's progress;
- (iv) request that the PSB's terms of reference be amended to include an expectation that in instances where a PSB partner is unable to attend a PSB meeting, a deputy attends on behalf of the partner to ensure that absence is not detrimental to the board's overall progress.
- (v) invite the Chair of the PSB to attend the PSB Select Committee on 11th October (10am) at which, feedback of the community engagement in preparation for the well-being assessment will be presented.

The Chair agreed to write to the Commissioner to communicate the Select Committee's outcomes and to invite her to attend the meeting on 11th October (10am) to offer her perspective on the powers offered to both the Commissioner and the Select Committee to ensure the PSB performs effectively.

Strong Communities Select Committees - 30th June 2016

Revenue and Capital Outturn Report

The Committee was satisfied with the answers to its questions on budget management, however, concerns were raised regarding the delivering of savings on public toilets and it was agreed to table a progress report on the review of public toilets to a future meeting.

	The Chair agreed to write to the Chair of the Economy and Development
	Select Committee in respect of the new lease for the cattle market in
	Raglan to request the Committee to scrutinise progress being made.
Future of the Civic Amenity Site	The Committee received a comprehensive report and Members noted
Contract	the progress that had been made, accepting the report's
	recommendations. The Committee requested to be kept regularly
	updated on progress in respect of the Heads of the Valleys Anaerobic
	Digestion partnership programme.
Recycling Review and	The Chair thanked the officer for bringing a position update to the Select
Implementation Plans	Committee on the recycling collections pilot planned to commence in
	September this year. Members commented on the proposals for the trial
	and remain unconvinced that the black boxes had sufficient benefits over
	the plastic sacks. The Committee agreed to receive a further update on
	the results of the pilot in due course.
Managing Public Open Space	The Committee considered the future strategy for managing and
	maintaining MCC owned public open space. Members agreed with the
	proposals presented in the report and were content that the report be
	taken to the next available Cabinet meeting.
Children and Young People's Se	elect Committees – 7 th July 2016
Children's Services	The Chair concluded that the Committee recognised that this is the
Improvement Journey:	beginning of a journey and acknowledged that officers are taking steps to
improvement sourney.	ensure safety and well-being and requested a report in 12 months' time.
- Children's Services	chaire safety and well being and requested a report in 12 months time.
	The Committee concluded that the workforce development plan was a
Improvement	positive report which reflected the need to get the right people in the
Programme	right places. It also heighted the need to develop a confident, competent
	and stable workforce which is fully supported by the Committee. The
- Workforce and Practice	report identified the key challenges and the changes being addressed.
Development Plan	Members signalled their interest in being involved in some of the training
	sessions and requested that the officer bring the training plan (for
 Commissioning Strategy 	children and adults to ascertain progress in developing a competent and
	able workforce in 9-12 months' time.
	able workforce in 9-12 months time.
	The Chain the alread Office of feather common beautiful along the already which had
	The Chair thanked Officers for the comprehensive, clear report which had
	raised some important points. The Committee endorsed the strategy and
	supported all aspects of the improvement journey as a whole. The
	Committee recognised that Monmouthshire has an over representation
	of children who are subject to care orders and hoped that the strategy,
	when evaluated later this year will prove to be effective. The Committee
	acknowledged that early intervention and prevention together with
	family support services may reduce numbers and felt that the report was
	clear and should be endorsed. They asked to review the strategy in 9-12
	months' time.
2015/16 Performance Report:	The Committee discussed the report which raised a number of issues that
Improvement Objectives and	had been discussed in previous agenda items and agreed to keep a
Outcome Agreement	watching brief on the progress of children's services.
Revenue and Capital Outturn	Members raised concern over the ability to achieve the necessary capital
report	receipts in order to fund 21 st century schools. The Committee agreed to
	discuss these concerns at their meeting on 11 th July.

Joint Meeting of the Children and Young People's and Economy and Development Select Committees – 11th July 2016	
ICT in Schools Investment Programme	 i. Transition arrangements. ii. The three schools that have not signed up to the SLA but have an opportunity to join. iii. Encourage contractors to commence work over the summer holidays with a view to connecting schools to the 100mb line as soon as possible. iv. The Select Committee will receive a monthly communication regarding schools connections to the 100mb line via newsletter. The Committees agreed to accept the report and re-visit this matter
Schools curriculum - Digital literacy and within the curriculum	 when the timescales referred to in appendix 2 have been met. The Select Committee discussed the following: Teacher training. Additional funding for training. Infrastructure being in place if Estyn should undertake school inspections during September 2016. Private sector engagement with schools and encouragement of schools to embrace this.
21 st Century Schools	Members agreed to accept the report. The Committee was inquorate and the meeting was adjourned.
Adults Select Committee – 12 th	
Partnership framework relating to Adult's Services	The Chair summarised that the item had been a helpful insight into the work of partnerships in Monmouthshire adding that although the PSB Select Committee was responsible for the overall scrutiny of the PSB, there were key areas for individual Select Committees to consider specific matters in more depth.
Performance Reporting, Outcome Agreements and Improvement Plan	The Chair sought and achieved agreement that the Committee had fulfilled the recommendations in the report. The Chair expressed his appreciation for the volume of data and graphs provided and its presentation which has provided greater clarity.
Joint Housing Solutions Service Pilot - Joint evaluation of the service	The Chair summarised that the pilot had been tried and evaluated, with a proposal to reverse the arrangement which, for a range of reasons hasn't achieved what was intended. He remarked that there is an expectation for authorities to collaborate more. He asked if there were any lessons learnt that could be communicated to other Heads of Service. It was recommended that a lead authority should be appointed instead of a joint approach. The recommendations were unanimously agreed. The Chair emphasised
	that this decision would not rule out joint working in the future. The Chair expressed his gratitude to the Head of Housing and Regeneration Manager for his report, for providing him with regular updates and invited him to return to report on reintegration.

. . .

Economy and Development Sel	Economy and Development Select Committee – 14 th July 2016	
Performance Reporting, Outcome Agreements and Improvement Plan	The Chair summarised that affordable housing, whole place planning, recycling and Superfast Broadband had been discussed at the meeting. Actions were agreed as follows:	
	 An update on whole place planning across the county for all Members was requested; The Welsh Government to be invited to the meeting regarding scrutiny of the roll out of Superfast Broadband. A Members Planning seminar on the Local Development Plan to be arranged and also to discuss the LDP at the next meeting as part of the Annual Monitoring Report, A post-referendum outcomes seminar to be arranged to consider any 	
Outcomes of the Business	impact on EU funded projects.	
Outcomes of the Business Breakfast	The Chair thanked Fiona Wilton for attending and for her contribution to the meeting acknowledging the positive discussion and the identification of areas for closer working. The Chair welcomed her attendance at future meetings.	
	The Chair identified actions from the meeting referring to the Destinations Management Plan which will be available for consultation to Ward Members and Committee Members in the near future.	
	The Chair recognised the strong feelings expressed regarding Chepstow TIC and requested that options similar to the Coleford model are explored.	
	Regarding Brown and white signage, the Chair summarised that the policy should be reviewed and added to the forward work programme.	
	Looking to the future, the Chair stated that the Committee would review Supplementary Planning Guidance on Tourism in February prior to its adoption in April.	
Cardiff City Region Board	The Committee requested an informal visit to Mitel.	
Strong Communities Select Con	nmittees – 21st July 2016	
Public Protection 2015/16	The Chair commended officers for the work that they do, however,	
Performance Report	there were concerns for public health and aspects of the report. The Committee are keen to review matters in 6 months' time. During the budget setting process, Members would like this dealt with separately due the concerns raised.	
2015/16 Performance Report:	The Chair thanked the Officer for the detailed report and looked forward	
Improvement Objectives and Outcome Agreement	to the next 6 month update in November.	
People Services Annual Report	The Chair thanked the Officer for the report and asked for a copy of the	
Topic of the second	2014/15 staff survey form.	
	The Committee will look at reviewing this regularly.	